Discussion of the paper:

When in Rome: Local social norms and turnaround incentives

by Natasha Burns, Kristina Minnick and Mia Rivolta

Discussion by François Longin ESSEC Business School

Main interesting points of the paper

- Two important economic points (\$\$\$)
 - Top management structure of compensation (tournaments)
 - Firm performance
- Study of the impact of "social capital"
 - Social capital of the area where the firm has its headquarters
 - Areas in the US with low and high social capital
 - Natural experiments (e.g., when a firm moves its headquarters)
- Main results
 - Pay differentials between the CEO and other executives are lower in U.S. counties with higher social capital and higher in U.S. counties with lower social capital.
 - Better firm performance in counties with higher social capital.

Link between social capital and firm management

- Putman's social capital index
 - Most of the variables are estimated from large-scale, representative survey data.
 - Same population? Individuals, employees, top management

Natural experiments

- Legalization of medical and recreational use of marijuana
 - Change in social capital due to a decrease in the crime rate and more coordination across ethnic lines (P 12)
 - Link with firm management?
- Moving corporate headquarters
 - Importance/stability of corporate culture?
 - Corporate culture vs Local culture

Other comments

- A gender effect could also explain the results
 - Number of male/female CEOs in the data set?
 - Female style of management: communal (≈ high social capital)
 - Male style of management: agentic (≈ low social capital)
 - Reference: Eagly AH, Carli LL. 2003. The female leadership advantage: An evaluation of the evidence. The Leadership Quarterly 14(6): 807–834.
- About the Putnam social capital index
 - Questioning/Variants (results in the first page when I googled) / Robustness of the results
 - Methodology of the 1990s. LinkedIn?
 - Update of the index? Variable 14: Turnout in presidential elections 1988 and 1992 (Appendix B)
- About tournaments
 - Percentage of insider/outsider CEOs in the data set

Recommendation for my students and participants

- I always like to share academic research results with my undergraduate students and participants in executive programs (working in medium and large firms in France).
- What can I tell them?
 - Importance of the management style (linked to social capital)
 - Coherence between the management style and the structure of compensation